

BOARD RULES OF PROCEDURE - BOARD OF REVISION

Rules of Procedure pursuant to the Ohio Revised Code Sections 5715.02 et seq. and 323.66

I. PEOPLE WHO MAY APPEAR BEFORE THE BOARD:

- Property Owner
- An attorney, licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio, representing any party properly before the Board.
- Any other entity named in Revised Code Section 5715.19 (A) (1) (F).

II. FILING REQUIREMENTS

A. Sale requirement

1. The act requires that, before a political subdivision or other person may file a complaint with respect to property that the political subdivision or person does not own, the property must have been sold in an arm's length transaction in a year preceding the tax year for which the complaint is to be filed. In addition, the sale price must have been at least 10% and \$500,000 more than the auditor's current valuation. The \$500,000 threshold increases each year for inflation, beginning in tax year 2023.
2. For example, if a school board wishes to challenge the value of a property for tax year 2022, it may only do so if the property was sold in 2021 or earlier, it has not been sold since, and the auditor's valuation of the property for tax year 2022 is both 10% and \$500,000 less than the sale price.

B. Approval of Complaints

1. Before filing a property tax complaint against property it does not own, a legislative authority must, in addition to complying with the sale requirement, first adopt a resolution approving the filing at a public meeting. The resolution must identify the parcel number and the parcel's address; the name of an owner; the tax year for which the complaint will be filed; and the basis for the complaint (e.g., valuation, tax classification, CAUV status).
2. A single resolution must be confined to identifying a single parcel or multiple parcels having the same owner. The legislative authority may adopt one or more of these resolutions by a single vote, provided no other type of resolution addressing a different matter is adopted pursuant to that same vote, i.e., the measure could not be included in a "consent agenda."

C. Notice of Hearing

1. Before adopting the resolution, the legislative authority must send written notice by certified mail to one of the property owner's last known property tax-mailing address and, if different, to the property's street address. Alternatively, the notice may be sent to the owner by ordinary mail if it is also sent electronically to the owner. The notice must declare the intent of the legislative authority to adopt the resolution and state the proposed date of adoption and the basis for the complaint. The notice must be postmarked or, if electronic, sent at least seven days before the resolution is scheduled to be adopted.

III. COMPLAINT FILINGS

A. Electronic filing – DTE Form 1

1. The Board of Revision will accept the electronic filing of Complaint Forms via a dedicated email link. https://clermontsmartfile.iasworld.tylerhost.net/clermontoh_sf
2. The electronically filed DTE Form 1 will carry the statutory disclaimer as required when using the option of emailing an electronic filing, pursuant to ORC 5715.13 (B): *I declare under penalties of perjury that this complaint (including attachments) has been examined by me and to the best of my knowledge and belief is true, correct and complete.*"
3. Every complaint must be electronically signed by either the Party or an Attorney licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio.
4. If the complainant utilizes the electronic filing process, only one form is required to be filed.
5. In the case of a counter complaint, the counter complainant must submit a copy of their counter complaint and any accompanying documentation to the original complainant at the time it is filed with the Board of Revision.
6. All electronic submissions must be received no later than 11:59 p.m. Eastern Standard Time on the last day to file such a complaint, which is March 31st, pursuant to the Ohio Revised Code. After the filing deadline date and time, the dedicated email link will be deactivated.
7. The Board of Revision will accept at the time of filing additional documentation, provided such documents are clearly marked with the parcel number(s).

8. Disclaimer: The complainant assumes all risks associated with the use of electronic filing system, including the risk that the system may become unavailable at any time without prior notice, or that the confirmations or notifications sent by the system may be blocked or delayed by causes beyond the control of the Board of Revision. Complainant is hereby notified that they are solely responsible for confirming that all documents and filings have been properly received by the Board of Revision for the filing. Complainant, by its use of the electronic filing system, hereby agrees to hold the Board of Revision and Clermont County harmless in the event of any interruption, unavailability, error or breakdown in service that results in an error in the Complainant's filing or in Complainant being unable to make its filing electronically, regardless of the source of the interruption, unavailability, error or breakdown in service.

9. If the complaint is submitted by a legislative authority, question 15 on the DTE Form 1 must be completed and a copy of that resolution must be attached.

B. In person or by mail filing – **DTE Form 1 and DTE Form 2**

1. Every complaint must be signed by either the Party or, an Attorney licensed to practice law in the State of Ohio.
2. Every complaint must be completed in full. A complaint which does not contain the complainant's opinion of value stated on the complaint form will be dismissed.
3. In addition to the original, 2 copies of each complaint and any accompanying documentation must be filed with the Auditor's Office.
4. In the case of a counter-complaint, the counter complainant must submit a copy of their counter complaint and any accompanying documentation to the original complainant at the time it is filed with the Board of Revision.

All correspondence should be sent to the attention of:

Linda L. Fraley
Clermont County Auditor
Secretary
Clermont County Board of Revision
101 East Main Street
Batavia, OH 45103-2961

5. If the complaint is submitted by a legislative authority, question 15 on the DTE Form 1 and question 11 on the DTE Form 2 must be completed and a copy of that resolution must be attached.

IV. COUNTER COMPLAINT PROCEDURE

- A. The County Auditor, as Secretary of the Board, will provide information related to current complaints via the website. Complaints in which the stated amount of increase or decrease is at least \$50,000 in market value, each board of education whose school district may be affected by the complaint may file a counter complaint.
- B. Within thirty days after a complaint has been filed, or after the last day such complaints may be filed, a board of education may file a counter complaint in support of, or objecting to, the amount of increase or decrease in value as stated on the original complaint. The board of education filing a counter complaint is requested by the Board to provide service to the original complaining party.
- C. Upon filing a counter complaint, the board of education shall be made a party to the complaint.
- D. If the board of education files the original complaint, the owner shall be notified and shall automatically be made a party to the complaint.

V. SCHEDULING HEARINGS

- A. The County Auditor, as Secretary of the Board, shall schedule complaints for hearing.
- B. A notice stating the date, time, and place of the hearing shall be sent by regular mail or electronically to all parties of the complaint (if address is known) not less than ten (10) days prior to the hearing.
- C. Along with the notice a copy of these rules shall be provided to each party of the complainant.
- D. All hearings shall be open to the public.
- E. Failure to appear before the Board at any scheduled hearing date and time shall constitute failure to prosecute and is grounds for dismissal of the party's complaint or counter-complaint.

VI. PRE-HEARING DOCUMENT SUBMISSION PROCEDURE

Written Documents

A party filing any written documents with the Board, as set forth below, shall file two copies of each such document with the Board. Photographs need only be submitted in the original without copies.

Submission of Exhibits for the Hearing Date

- A. A party seeking to change the Auditor's valuation on one or more properties shall file with the Board and serve on all other parties no later than fourteen days prior to the scheduled hearing date, all of the documents, photographs, records and other exhibits it intends to introduce into evidence at the hearing, other than any appraisal reports or the written reports of any other expert witnesses.
- B. Appraisal reports or the written reports of any other experts that a party intends to introduce at the hearing shall be filed with the Board and served on all other parties no later than seven days prior to the hearing date. Such appraisal reports shall include a summary of the expert's qualifications and credentials.

Failure to Comply with Deadlines

- F. If a party fails to timely comply with the deadlines or filing requirements set forth above, then the Board may
 - 1. Refuse to accept or consider the documents or appraisal or expert reports untimely filed
 - 2. Adjourn the hearing to a date of its selection to provide it with sufficient time to review such documents or reports, or
 - 3. Take such other actions consistent with applicable law as it deems just and warranted.

VII. APPEARANCE BEFORE THE BOARD

- A. Any person who is a party to the complaint may appear at the hearing before the Board.
- B. Attorneys representing a party to the complaint or counter-complaint shall not be permitted to testify or appear in any capacity other than that of counsel. The owner of the property, or an appropriate and qualified expert witness, is required to be present at the hearing in order to give testimony at the hearing.

VIII. WITNESSES AND TESTIMONY

- A. The Board may call persons before it and examine them under oath as to their own or another's real property to be placed on the tax list and duplicate for taxation, or the value thereof. [ORC 5715.10]

- B. If a person notified to appear before the Board refuses, or neglects to appear at the time required, or appearing, refuses to be sworn or answer any question put to him/her by the Board or by its order, the Board shall make a complaint thereof in writing to the probate judge of the county. [ORC 5715.10]
- C. Any witness, who shall be giving expert testimony on the complaint, must be qualified as an expert [Ohio Rules of Evidence #702 and #703].
- D. Testimony as to comparable properties, their values and recent sales values shall be considered expert testimony and may only be presented by expert witnesses properly qualified as provided herein. Mere testimony that a certain property was transferred on a certain date for a certain price may be submitted to the Board in the form of certified copies of transfer deeds, or through any other acceptable form of evidence contemplated under Ohio Rules of Evidence. However, the Board shall not consider them as comparable sales without expert opinion testimony indicating how they are comparable.
- E. A complainant or counter-complainant party's attorney may not appear in lieu of the owner to provide testimony. The owner's opinion of value may only be expressed by the owner, or an appropriate expert witness.

IX. HEARSAY EVIDENCE

- A. Hearsay is a statement, other than one made by the declarant while testifying at the trial or hearing, which is offered to prove the truth of the matter asserted in the statement. Often hearsay takes the form of one person seeking to testify about what another person said or thought. All testimony elicited at hearings hereunder must be relevant and elicited from a person with actual and personal knowledge of the matters testified about in order for such testimony or evidence to be presented to and considered by the Board.
- B. The Board may refuse to accept hearsay evidence including, but not limited to, hearsay evidence contained in documents.

X. SUBMITTING EVIDENCE TO THE BOARD AND HEARING PROCEDURE

- A. Unless otherwise ordered by the Board, the party that first filed its complaint shall present its evidence first at the hearing.
- B. Upon completion of the introduction of testimony and evidence by the party that first filed its complaint, the opposing party or parties may introduce testimony and other evidence in support of their counter-complaint or in opposition to the opposing party's complaint.

C. For income producing commercial or industrial property the Board requires that the following information be submitted to the Board.

1. Physical data

- a) Description of the improvements to the property, including the age of all buildings and other improvements, the type of construction, the size of the property, the mechanical or other equipment that is affixed to the property, and the use and functional adequacy of such mechanical or other equipment.
- b) Any changes in the condition of the property occurring or completed within the last three years (such as new construction) together with the actual cost of any new improvements and the date completed.

2. Rental property

- a) Financial statements detailing all income, actual operating expenses, fixed expenses, replacement reserves, and rental losses due to vacancy and uncollectable accounts for the tax year in question and for the prior three years or back to the last transfer of ownership, if transferred within the past three years.
- b) The identity and description (including size and type) of each rental unit.
- c) The current rent roll showing potential rent.
- d) The lease or rental date for each tenant and the lease terms, options, base rent plus provisions for additional rent or service charges, etc.
- e) All other income, such as parking, laundry, etc. generated from the property

3. Other information

- a) Provide current zoning status of property.
- b) Provide a sketch, map and floor plan of the buildings (not required for apartments).

D. The Board may request additional information at the hearing or by written notice.

E. The complainant shall provide the Board with all information or evidence within his/her knowledge or possession that affects the real property in question [ORC 5715.19]. Evidence and/or information not presented to the Board cannot later be presented on any appeal, unless good cause is shown for the failure to present such information to the Board.

XI. INDEPENDENT OR APPRAISER EXPERTS

- A. All agents, appraisers, (or other representatives) presenting evidence to the Board shall submit a copy of their contract with the owner as a part of the evidence of the case.
- B. Any individual relying on a document prepared by an independent appraiser or expert witness shall require that individual to be present at the hearing to testify before the Board. The Board shall not rely solely on the document itself and may question the individual regarding the appraisal or exhibits which have been submitted.
- C. Any document submitted as evidence, other than those stated herein, that was prepared by an individual not present at the hearing shall not be considered because the individual cannot be questioned by the Board.

XII. EVIDENCE OF VALUATION

- A. Evidence of valuation must relate to the total value of both land and improvements.
- B. The Board may increase or decrease the total value of any parcel included in a complaint.

XIII. RECORD

- A. The Board creates a formal record of the activities that take place before it.
- B. Each hearing's minutes are taken either using an audio or video recording system, or court stenographer.
- C. A transcript of the hearing is available at the cost of either reproducing the tape recording or the cost of obtaining the transcript from the court stenographer.

XIV. GROUNDS FOR DISMISSAL

Grounds for dismissal include, but are not limited to, the following:

- A. A complaint for the current tax year shall be filed with the County Auditor on or before the thirty-first day of March of the ensuing tax year [ORC 5715.19 (A)(1)]. Failure to comply with that deadline shall result in dismissal of the complaint.
- B. The complaint form (DTE Form 1) is not signed.
- C. Failure to complete or show value information in Section 8 on DTE Form 1.

- D. Any complainant party not providing information deemed to be competent and relevant which is requested by the Board
- E. ORC 5715.19 (A)(2) states, "No person, legislative authority, or officer shall file a complaint against the valuation or assessment of any parcel that appears on the tax list if it filed a complaint against the valuation or assessment of that parcel for any prior tax year in the same interim period, unless the person, legislative authority, or officer alleges that the valuation or assessment should be changed due to one or more of the following circumstances that occurred after the tax lien date for the tax year for which the prior complaint was filed and that the circumstances were not taken into consideration with respect to the prior complaint:
1. The property was sold in an arm's length transaction, as described in section 5713.03 of the Revised Code.
 2. The property lost value due to some casualty.
 3. Substantial improvement was added to the property.
 4. An increase or decrease of at least 15% in the property's occupancy has had a substantial economic impact of the property."

XV. PUBLIC NOTICE - NOTICE & REGULARITY OF BOARD OF REVISION MEETINGS

The Board of Revision of Clermont County, Ohio in compliance with ORC 121.22(F), hereby establishes the method whereby any person may determine the date, time and place of regular meetings and the date, time, place and purposes of special meetings of the Board, and whereby the news media may be notified of the date, time, place and purposes of special and emergency meetings of the Board of Revision.

A. Regular meetings

Regular meetings of the Board of Revision will be held the Second Monday in January required by ORC 5715.09 at a time to be determined in the Auditor's Office First Floor Conference Room, 101 East Main Street, Batavia, Ohio. Additional Regular meetings of the Board of Revision will be held the first Monday of April, May, June, July, August, and September unless a legal holiday, then the next business day at a time to be determined in the Auditor's Office First Floor conference room, 101 East Main Street, Batavia, Ohio. The Clerk of the Board of Revision shall give notice of regular meetings by posting a copy of this on the bulletin board in the lobby of the County Administration building.

B. Special and emergency meetings

Special meetings of the Board of Revision will be held at the call of any member of the Commission. The call for a special meeting shall specify the date, time, location and purposes of the meeting. Unless otherwise provided, special meetings will be held at the office of the County Auditor. The Clerk shall give notice of the date, time, location and purposes of a special meeting other than an emergency meeting by posting in the same location as provided for posting notice of regular

meetings. Notice shall be posted as far in advance of the meeting as practicable, but not less than twenty-four hours prior to the meeting. If there is sufficient time to provide twenty-four hours' notice, the Clerk shall give notice of an emergency meeting in the same manner as notice of a nonemergency special meeting. Otherwise, notice of an emergency meeting is not required, except as provided in section C.

C. Notice to individuals requiring notice of regular, special and emergency meetings.

Any individuals including the News media who have requested notice of meetings, regular, special or otherwise, may do so in writing by sending such request via email to BORappeals@clermontcountyohio.gov or by calling 513.732.7150. A request for notice shall state the requestor's name, telephone number, a physical address or email to which notices are to be sent. Any such request shall remain in force for the calendar year. Prior to the mailing of notices, the requestor must provide \$5 to cover the expected cost of mailing notices for one year. Individuals including the News Media who have made a request shall be notified by the Clerk of the Board regarding date, time, location and purposes of any such meeting at least twenty-four hours in advance of the meeting. If the meeting is an emergency meeting,

the Clerk shall immediately notify the individuals including the News Media who have requested notification of the date, time, location and purposes of the meeting in advance of the meeting.

D. Notice of meetings to discuss particular business

The Clerk shall give reasonable advance notice of any special meeting at which a particular type of public business is to be discussed to any person who has requested such notice. If time permits, such notice shall be given. (See section C regarding a request for notice).

E. Special notice required by law

When a particular form or method of notice is required by statute for a public hearing or meeting of the Board of Revision, notice of the hearing or meeting shall be given in the form and manner prescribed by statute, in addition to notice otherwise required under this notice.

F. Hearings

Hearings are conducted by the Board of Revision for the determination of complaint applications presented to the Board of Revision. Hearings may be held during regular, special, emergency meetings or any other time that is convenient for the Board of Revision to hear complaints. Anyone desiring to be notified of hearings may do so in the same manner as requesting notice of meetings.

All Meetings and Hearings are held in the Auditor's Office, 101 East Main Street, Batavia, Ohio 45103, unless otherwise noted.

XVI. PUBLIC ATTENDANCE

- A. Board of Revision regular and special meetings are open to public inspection. Should any individual not involved with a hearing or Board business that day attend, he or she is allowed to observe hearings without participating. Participating is defined as making statements or asking questions or moving from the designated public space established by the Auditor.

- B. Any individual attending as part of public inspection is required to sign in and acknowledge if they plan to record the Board's meetings, whether using an audio or video recording device.